PLAINTIFFS' MOTION IN LIMINE

Case 2:08-cv-02987-RGK-SH Document 62 Filed 06/26/09 Page 1 of 46

asked to preserve each and every item of evidence, including DNA and biological evidence.

Defendants tested the evidence on November 28, 2007, March 05, 2008; and February 19, 2008. By even the earliest of these dates, Defendants had notice from **both** plaintiffs that a claim had been filed, and that the evidence needed to be preserved. Counsel for Thomas Barrera had written to defendants requesting preservation of evidence on the initial date of testing, and Maria Lazos had already filed a Claim Against Public Entity. By the next date of testing, Defendants had been contacted via correspondence by **both** counsel for Plaintiffs, and had actual knowledge of the need to preserve/conserve said evidence.

As stated in fuller detail in the County of Ventura Sheriff's Department Forensic Sciences Laboratory Reports, all of which are attached and incorporated herein, Defendants consumed the majority of DNA and biological evidence, or discarded almost the entirety of the remainder of said evidence. Neither plaintiff was advised in advance or during said testing that any procedures were going to be performed and that said DNA/biological evidence would be discarded if not consumed.

Spoliation of evidence is the destruction or alteration of evidence. Although a party need not have acted in "bad faith" to be held responsible for spoliation of evidence [see Glover v. BIC Corp. (9th Cir 1993) 6 F3d 1318, 1329], a party must have had notice that documents were relevant or potentially relevant to litigation before the documents were destroyed for spoliation of evidence to have occurred [United States ex rel. Aflatooni v. Kitsap Physicians Serv. (9th Cir 2002) 314 F3d 995, 1001; Akiona v. United States (9th Cir 1991) 938 F2d 158, 161].

While a litigant is under no duty to keep or retain every document in its possession once a complaint is filed, it is under a duty to preserve what it knows, or reasonably should know, is relevant in the action, is reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence, is reasonably likely to be requested during discovery, and/or is the subject of a pending discovery request [National Ass'n of Radiation Survivors v. Turnage (ND Cal 1987) 115 FRD 543, 556–557, citing Wm. T. Thompson Co. v. General Nutrition Corp. (CD Cal 1984) 593 F Supp 1443; see also Zubulake v. UBS Warburg LLC (SDNY 2003) 220 FRD

212, 216]. 1 A range of sanctions is available for spoliation of evidence under the court's inherent powers 2 [see, e.g., Unigard Sec. Ins. Co. v. Lakewood Eng'g & Mfg. Corp. (9th Cir 1992) 982 F2d 3 363, 368. Courts are invested with inherent powers that are governed not by rule or statute, 4 5 but by the control necessarily vested in courts to manage their own affairs so as to achieve the orderly and expeditious disposition of cases [Chambers v. NASCO, Inc. (1991) 501 US 6 7 32, 43–49, 111 S Ct 2123, 115 L Ed2d 27]. The following types of sanctions are examples of those imposed under this authority: 8 9 Exclusion of evidence [see, e.g., Unigard Sec. Ins. Co. v. Lakewood Eng'g & Mfg. Corp. 10 (9th Cir 1992) 982 F2d 363, 368]. Dismissal [see, e.g., ; Leon v. IDX Sys. Corp. (9th Cir 2006) 464 F3d 951, 958 Halaco 11 12 Eng'g Co. v. Costle (9th Cir 1988) 843 F2d 376, 380]. An award of attorney's fees against a party or counsel who has acted in bad faith, 13 14 vexatiously, wantonly, or for oppressive reasons [Leon v. IDX Sys. Corp. (9th Cir 2006) 464 F3d 951, 961]. 15 16 In cases in which the drastic sanctions of dismissal or default are ordered, the range of discretion for a district court is narrowed, and the losing party's noncompliance must be due 17 to willfulness, fault, or bad faith [Leon v. IDX Sys. Corp. (9th Cir 2006) 464 F3d 951, 958]. 18 19 A finding of any of these circumstances may justify the sanction of dismissal [Halaco Eng'g 20 Co. v. Costle (9th Cir 1988) 843 F2d 376, 381]. 21

The existence and degree of prejudice to the wronged party is a factor in the determination of whether to impose a severe sanction such as dismissal [Leon v. IDX Sys. Corp. (9 Cir 2006) 464 F3d 951, 958]. In some published cases, the Ninth Circuit has referred to this factor as optional [see, e.g., Halaco Eng'g Co. v. Costle (9th Cir 1988) 843 F2d 376, 382].

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

25.97[2][e] Imposition of Severe Sanctions Requires Consideration of Public Interest and Policy.

Before imposing a harsh sanction such as dismissal, the district court must consider the

public interest in expeditious resolution of litigation, the court's own need to manage its dockets, and the public policy favoring disposition of cases on the merits [Leon v. IDX Sys. Corp. (9th Cir 2006) 464 F3d 951, 958].

25.97[3] Sanction Must Be Commensurate With Degree to Which Evidence Was Compromised or Destroyed.

In the Ninth Circuit, the particular sanction levied under the court's inherent power depends on [see, e.g., Unigard Sec. Ins. Co. v. Lakewood Eng'g & Mfg. Corp. (9th Cir 1992) 982 F2d 363, 369]:

- The degree to which the evidence was altered, lost, or destroyed.
- The degree of the responsible party's culpability.
- Surrounding circumstances such as the parties' previous ability to view or test that evidence prior to its spoliation.

When the plaintiff insurer destroyed an electric heater and a boat prior to filing an action against the heater manufacturer for subrogation based on the allegation that the heater cause a fire in the boat, the proper sanction was exclusion of evidence regarding the alleged defect in the heater [see Unigard Sec. Ins. Co. v. Lakewood Eng'g & Mfg. Corp. (9th Cir 1992) 982 F2d 363, 369].

When appropriate, a party that destroyed potential evidence should show that he or she did not do so in response to the litigation, perhaps by indicating that the evidence was destroyed prior to litigation and before the party could have any reasonable indication that litigation would be brought relative to that evidence [see, e.g., Akiona v. United States (9th Cir 1991) 938 F2d 158, 161, cert. denied, 503 US 962 (1992)].

A party should only be penalized for destroying documents if it was wrong to do so, and that requires, at a minimum, some notice that the documents are potentially relevant [Akiona v. United States (9th Cir 1991) 938 F2d 158, 161, cert. denied, 503 US 962 (1992)]. A party should only be penalized for destroying documents if it was wrong to do so, and that requires, at a minimum, some notice that the documents are potentially relevant [Akiona v. United States (9th Cir 1991) 938 F2d 158, 161, cert. denied, 503 US 962 (1992)].

In the case at bar, there was an officer involved shooting resulting in the death of a young individual. By the time of the initial testing, all defendants had both actual and/or constructive knowledge that any and/or all DNA evidence must be preserved. Said evidence was clearly relevant and pertinent to any pending or upcoming litigation. Officer Salinas and all entity defendants have utilized a self-defense claim *ab initio*. Testing on the knife that allegedly belonged to the deceased, the tool allegedly thrown at the Officer by the Deceased, and all other evidence referenced above is essential for **all** parties, not just defendants.

As argued in Plaintiffs' Motion to Exclude any Evidence pertaining to the Truck, defendants have an unfair advantage over Plaintiffs by the very nature of their existence. Due to their status as law enforcement and public entities, defendants could and **did** use their authority to procure evidence and/or witnesses equally necessary to all parties, and to discard, consume, and otherwise keep Plaintiffs from equal access to said evidence and/or witnesses. To level the playing field, the Court should impose a greater standard upon any party who could abuse their position of power.

In a sense, defendants are guilty of the very abuses that plaintiffs have charged them with. Plaintiffs case is premised upon the abuse of Defendants' position, authority and power, which resulted in the wrongful and illegal killing of a young adult without just cause or reason. Defendants **knew** and were given **actual notice** of the need to preserve the evidence in this action. They wilfully disobeyed the duty imposed on **all parties** to play fairly and to have a trial **on the merits** with equal access to all involved.

21 ///

22 | ///

23 ///

24 | ///

25 ///

26 | ///

27 ///

28 | ///

1	It is for this reason that	Plaintiff's respectfully request that the Court order the
2	exclusion of any evidence listed	herein, and exclude any reference to any such evidence.
3	DATED: June 26, 2009	LAW OFFICE'S OF KIM D. SCOVIS
4		JENNY SCOVIS
5		Attorneys for Plaintiff
6		V
7	DATED: June 26, 2009	LAW OFFICES OF GREGORY A. YATES
8		GREGORY A. VATES
9		Attorneys for Plaintiff
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
		7
	∥ Pi	AINTIFFS' MOTION IN LIMINE

Exhibit

66 1 99

Oxrades December 102987-RGK-SH Document 62

Evidence Manager

PROPERTY REPORT

File No.:

07-0025163

Cont No.:

07-025163

Charges:

Officer Involved Shotting

Investigator: 2493 Det Joe Chase

Date In:

10/03/2007

Concluded:

01/31/2008 Page: 1

Item	Item Description	Current Location	Date/Loc Siezed	Member
00001	Photos of Andrew Salinas taken after incident	Photo	10/03/2007 oxnard police station	4642 Officer Eric Mora
00002	digital photographs of crime scene	Photo	10/03/2007 fifth st/hobson way	5181 Officer Roger Garcia
00003	6 inch Knife (fixed blade) with broken tip Photo Marker #1 Collected from roadway near suspect's body- BIN #2	LAB	10/03/2007 Crime Scene	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
`904	'WIN' 9mm Luger Cartridge Case Photo Marker #2 Collected from roadway near suspect's body- BIN #2	187-2	10/03/2007 Crime Scene	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
)0005	'WIN' 9mm Luger Cartridge Case Photo Marker #3 BIN #2	187-2	10/03/2007 Crime Scene	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
⊕0006	'WIN' 9mm Luger Cartridge Case Photo Marker #4 Collected from roadway near suspect's body- BIN #2	187-2	10/03/2007 Crime Scene	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
0007	'WIN' 9mm Luger Cartridge Case Photo Marker #5 Collected from roadway near suspect's body- BIN #2	187-2	10/03/2007 Crime Scene	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00 008	'Pittsburgh' multi tool Allen Wrench Photo Marker #6 Collected from roadway near victim's body- BIN #2	LAB	10/03/2007 Crime Scene	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
)0 009	'Verizon' Cell Phone - S/N F0714022340 Photo Marker #7 Collected from sidewalk south of victim's body- BIN#2	187-2	10/03/2007 Crime Scene	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
010	Blood and Control Sample Photo Marker #8 Collected from sidewalk south of suspect's body	Freezer	10/03/2007 Crime Scene	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
0011	115 Digital Photographs Tag#182665	Photo	10/03/2007 Crime Scene	4935 CSI Debra Schambra

	Case 2:08-cv-02987			6/26/09 Page 10 of 46
.m	Item Description	Current Location	Date/Loc Siezed	Member
J12	'Beretta' 9mm Handgun S/N - BER262601 Collected from Officer Andrew Salinal	GUNBOX07	10/03/2007 Police Station 251 South C Street	Total Collain Dia
00013	Magazine containing 15 rounds (from duty belt closest to buckle) Collected from Officer Andrew Salinas- BIN #2	187-2	10/03/2007 Police Station 251 South C Street	
00014	Magazine containing 15 rounds (from duty belt next to radio) Collected from Officer Andrew Salinas- BIN #2	187-2	10/03/2007 Police Station 251 South C Street	To a del debia delibilitya
00015	Magazine containing 11 rounds (from Beretta 9mm Handgun) Collected from Officer Andrew Salinas' duty weapon	187-3	10/03/2007 Police Station 251 South C Street	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00016	1 'WIN' 9mm Luger Bullet (from chamber of Baretta 9mm Handgun) Collected from Officer Andrew Salinas' duty weapon- BIN #2	187-2	10/03/2007 Police Station 251 South C Street	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
⁻ 1017	'Olympus' Digital Recorder Collected from Officer Andrew Salinas- BIN #2	187-3	10/03/2007 Police Station 251 South C Street	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
J0018	'Flying Cross' Uniform Shirt worn by Salinas Collected from Officer Andrew Salinas	LAB	10/03/2007 Police Station 251 South C Street	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00019	'Elbeco' Uniform Pants worn by Salinas Collected from Officer Andrew Salinas	LAB	10/03/2007 Police Station 251 South C Street	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00020	'Magnum' Boots - Size 8 - worn by Salinas Collected from Officer Andrew Salinas	187-2	10/03/2007 Police Station 251 South C Street	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00021	Bent metal coat hanger Photo Marker #10 Found lying in street at intersection of Fifth Street and G Street- BIN#2	187-2	10/03/2007 Crime Scene	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00022	Misc. Metal Parts Collected from driver's floorboard of White Chevy Silverado, lic# 8H10852- BIN#2	187-2	10/03/2007 Crime Scene	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
	Red Metal Chisel Collected from front bench seat of white Chevy Silverado, lic.# 8H10852- BIN #2	187-2	10/03/2007 Crime Scene	4935 CSI Debra Schambra

тие мо.;

	Od3C 2.00 CV 02307	NON OIT DOCA	ment oz i ned o	0/20/03 Tage 11 01 40
m	Item Description	Current Location	Date/Loc Siezed	Member
J24	Folding Knive with blood Collected from front bench seat of white Chevy Silverado Pick-Up Truck, lic.#8H10852-	187	10/03/2007 Crime Scene	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00025	"BMX" Rampage Bike - S/N CS070512223 Collected from sidewalk near white Chevy Silverado	WAREHOUSE	10/03/2007 Crime Scene	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00026	5 Swabs from "BMX" Bike Collected from grips and tape around flashlights	187	10/03/2007 Crime Scene	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00027	111 Digital Photographs from crime scene Tag# 177145 Downloaded onto the Oxnard Police Department Digital Database	Photo	10/03/2007 Crime Scene	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00028	1 Pair of "Converse" Tennis Shoes with white socks Collected from suspect's body at autopsy	187-3	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
1029	1 Pair "Anchor Blue" Jeans Collected from suspect's body at autopsy	LAB	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00030	1 Black and Brown Belt with key chain and empty knife sheath Collected from suspect's body at autopsy	187-3	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00031	Metal Spoon, Blue Ball Point Pen, 5 Sockets Collected from suspect's right rear pants pocket- BIN#2	187-2	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00032	Seringe with bent needle Collected from right rear pocket of suspect's pants- BIN #2	187-2	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
)0033	\$10.00 U.S. Currency - 1 five dollar bill and 5 one dollar bills Collected from left rear pocket of suspect's pants	BIG SAFE	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
1034	Blue 'Bic' Lighter, Multi-Tool Allen Wrench Collected from right front pocket of suspect's pants- BIN#2	Dets	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra

File No.:

∍m	Item Description	Current Location	Date/Loc Siezed	Member
J035	1 Pair of black and white "Fruit of the Loom" Boxer Shorts Collected from suspect's body at autopsy	187-3	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00036	1 black blood stained t-shirt Collected from suspect's body at autopsy	Dets	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00037	1 white blood stained "South Pole" t-shirt Collected from suspect's body at autopsy	Dets	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00038	1 white "Nauticia" blood stained tank top Collected from suspect's body at autopsy	Dets	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00039	1 Brown Paper Bag from suspect's right hand Collected at suspect's autopsy	Dets	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00040	1 Brown Paper Bag from suspect's left hand Collected at suspect's autopsy	Dets	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
J0041	1 Pair of "Peerless" Handcuffs with the name Salinas on them Collected from suspect's left wrist at autopsy- BIN#2	187-2	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00042	1 Gunshot Residue Kit Collected from suspect's hands at autopsy- BIN#2	187-2	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00043	1 Spent Bullet from gunshot wound #1 Collected from suspect's upper back- BIN #2	187-2	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
`944	1 Spent Bullet from gunshot wound #2 Collected from suspect's lower back at autopsy-BIN #2	187-2	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra

File No.:

÷m	Item Description	Current Location	n Date/Loc Siezed	Member
145	Collected from suspect at autopsy	B.I.	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00046	DNA Sample from suspect Collected from suspect at autopsy	187	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00047	Rolled Fingerprints of Suspect Rolled by Shasta Gainer at Crime Scene	B.I	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00048	164 Digital Photographs Tag# 177:145 Downloaded onto the Oxnard Police Department Digital Database under this DR Number	Photo	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00049	Blood Stained White Sheet From Suspect's Body Bag	187	10/03/2007 Ventura County Coroner's Office - Suspect's Autopsy	4935 CSI Debra Schambra
00050	LICENSE PLATES OF VEHICLES IN CRIME SCENE	Photo	10/03/2007 SCENE	4546 Officer Michael Robison
0051	Photos of witnesses standing in front of 837 W. Fifth St	Photo	10/03/2007 837 W Fifth St	4671 Det Curtis Smith
0052	PHOTOS OF GRAFFITI FROM MEMORIAL	Photo	10/07/2007 FIFTH@ HOBSON	5223 Officer Pedro Rodriguez
00053	21 DNA SAMPLE/CONTROL AND BLANK SWABS FROM TRUCK COLLECTED FROM WHITE CHEVY SILVERADO TRUCK CA. LIC #8H10852	187	10/09/2007 BI PROCESSING GARAGE	5201 CSI Bill Johnson
00054	PIECE OF METAL (POSSIBLE TIP OF KNIFE) COLLECTED FROM DRIVER'S SIDE FLOORBOARD OF WHITE CHEVY SILVERADO TRUCK CA. LIC #8H108	LAB	10/09/2007 BI. PROCESSING GARAGE	5201 CSt Bill Johnson
>∩ 05 5	38 DIGITAL PHOTOS TAG #177147 THE PHOTOGRAPHS WERE DOWNLOADED ONTO THE OXNARD POLICE DEPARTMENT DIGITAL DATABASE	Photo	10/09/2007 BI. PROCESSING GARAGE	5201 CSI Bill Johnson

File No.:

				o lago. o
m	Item Description	Current Location	Date/Loc Siezed	Member
.J56	1 METAL PART (POSS KNIFE BLADE) REMOVED FROM ITEM #22	LAB	10/09/2007 B.I. PROCESSING ROOM	5201 CSI Bill Johnson
00057	1 DNA SWAB FROM ITEM #56 COLLECTED FROM ITEM #56	187	10/09/2007 B.I. PROCESSING ROOM	5201 CSI Bill Johnson
00058	DNA / BLANK SWAB FROM RED METAL CHISEL COLLECTED FROM ITEM #23	187	10/09/2007 B.I. PROCESSING ROOM	5201 CSI Bill Johnson
00059	DNA SWAB COLLECTED FROM MISC METAL PARTS COLLECTED FROM ITEM #22	187	10/09/2007 B.I. PROCESSING ROOM	5201 CSI Bill Johnson
00060	BUCCAL SWABS REFERENCE SWABS TAKEN FROM LUIS SIMEMTAL R/O OF CHEVY SIVERADO	187	10/10/2007 OXNARD PD	4804 Det Luis Mancha
00061	Interior and Exterior photos of the windows at 500 Hobson Wy #1 Downloaded into the Homicide and Property Drives as 0725163 500 Hobson 1 12-27-07 CS	Photo	12/27/2007 500 Hobson Way #1	4671 Det Curtis Smith

Exhibit

e 2:08-cv-02987-RGK-SIC O of white har 60 F File to 16/26/08 A Page 16 of 46

SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT

800 S. VICTORIA AVENUE VENTURA, CA 93009 (805) 654-2370 FORENSIC SCIENCES LABORATORY REPORT

LAB CASE NUMBER L07-6430_{万か}

REPORT NUMBER

SUBJECT(S):

VICTIM: SALINAS, ANDREW SUSPECT: BARRERA, THOMAS

AGENCY:

OXNARD POLICE DEPARTMENT: Detective Chase

AGENCY CASE NUMBER: 07-25163

OFFENSE(S): 245 P.C.

FORENSIC BIOLOGY SECTION

EVIDENCE

Item 4 (Tag #07-002516300003): 6" FIXED BLADE KNIFE W/BROKEN TIP

Item 4A: Swab of knife handle Item 4B: Swab of knife blade

em 6 (Tag #07-002516300024); FOLDING KNIFE em 6A: Swab of portion of red brown stain on blade

em 6B: Swab of handle

Hem 7 (Tag# 07-002516300026): SWABS FROM "BMX" BIKE

Item 7A. Swabs from Mondel bar grips

Item 7A1: Sample

Item 7A2. Blank (not examined)

Item 7B: Swab from tape on bike seat

Item 7C: Swab from tape on flashlight on bike stem

Item 8 (Tag #07-002516300046): Reference sample from Thomas Barrera

Item 9 (Tag #07-002516300053) - (21) DNA SAMPLE/CONTROL & BLANK SWABS FROM TRUCK

Item 9A: Swabs from interior drivers side door lever

Item 9A1: Sample

Item 9A2: Control (not examined)

Item 9B: Swabs from steering wheel

item 9B1:Sample

Item 9B2: Control (not examined)

Item 9C: Swabs from glove box (not examined)

Item 9D: Swabs from interior passenger side door handle/lever

Item 9D1: Sample

Item 9D2: Control (not examined)

item 9E: Swabs from interior drivers side door handle/pull

Item 9E1: Sample

"em 9E2: Control (not examined)

m 9F: Swabs from gearshift lever/knob

em 9F1: Sample

.em 9F2: Control (not examined)

Item 9G: Swabs from interior passenger side door pull (not examined)

Hem 9H: Swabs from ignition switch (not examined)

Case 2:08-cv-02987-RGK-SH Thoctument 62 Filed 06/26/09 Page 17 of 46

em 91: Swabs from exterior (not examined)

.em 9J Swabs from exterior passenger side door handle (not examined)

Item 10 (Tag #07-002516300054): PIECE OF METAL (POSSIBLE TIP OF KNIFE) (Not analyzed for DNA)

Item 11 (Tag #07-002516300056) ONE METAL PART (POSSIBLE KNIFE BLADE)

Item 11A: Swab of piece of metal

Item 12 (Tag #07-002516300060) Reference sample from Luis Simenfal

Item 13 (Tag #07-002516300057) SWAB FROM (POSSIBLE KNIFE BLADE)

Item 14 (Tag #07-002516300058) SWABS FROM RED METAL CHISEL

Item 14A. Sample

Item 14B: Blank (not examined)

Item 15 (Tag #07-002516300059): DNA SWAB COLLECTED FROM MISC METAL PARTS

OBJECTIVE / METHODS

To examine items 4, 6, 10, 11 and 14A for the presence of blood.

To determine the STR DNA types from the evidence listed and compare to the STR DNA types from the reference samples from Thomas Barrera and Luis Simental (items 8 and 12).

nis process entails extracting DNA from the samples. The extracted DNA was amplified using the polymerase chain action (PCR) and a DNA profile was obtained using the AmpF/STR COffler™ and/or Profiler Plus™ Amplification Kits and the ABI Prism 310 Genetic Analyzer at the following Short Tandem Repeat (STR) loci: D3S1358, vWA, FGA, D8S1179, D21S11, D18S51, D5S818, D13S317, D7S820, D16S539, THO1, TPOX, CSF1PO and the gender marker amelogenin

RESULTS

The presence of blood was not detected on items 4, 10, 11 and 14A.

The presumptive presence of blood was detected on the blade of item 6.

Due to an insufficient amount of DNA, STR typing was not performed on items 7B, 9A1, 9E1, 11A, 13 and 15

The results from the reagent blanks and positive and negative amplification controls were as expected.

CONCLUSIONS

Thomas Barrera is the source of the DNA from the swab of the knife handle, the portion of the red brown stain on the blade and the swab from the red metal chisel (items 4A, 6A and 14A). This conclusion is based on the assumption that Thomas Barrera does not have an identical twin. The approximate frequency of randomly selected, unrelated individuals that would be included as possible DNA contributors to items 4A, 6A and 14A is 1 in 1.7 quintillion African Americans, 1 in 47 quadrillion Caucasians and 1 in 8.1 quadrillion Hispanics. Luis Simental is excluded as a possible source of this

ne DNA obtained from the swab of the handle (item 6B) is a mixture from at least two individuals. A major DNA entributor profile was determined. Thomas Barrera is included as a possible source of this major contributor DNA. Assuming a single contributor, the approximate frequency of randomly selected, unrelated individuals that would be ncluded as a possible major DNA contributor to item 6B is 1 in 3 trillion African Americans, 1 in 230 billion Caucasians

PRINTED: 11/28/2007 3:39 PM

Page 2 of 4

REVIEWED BY: TR AR CL

Case 2:08-cv-02987-RGK-SH, Document 62 Filed 06/26/09 Page 18 of 46

and 1 in 110 billion Hispanics.^{1,3} No conclusion regarding the source of the minor alleles detected will be offered due to the limited amount of data available. Luis Simental is excluded as a possible contributor to this DNA mixture.

DNA profiles were not obtained from the swabs from the Mondel bar grips (item 7A1) and the swabs from interior passenger side door handle/lever (item 9D1). Alleles were detected at a few loci for each item but not enough data was collected to determine the sources of these DNA samples.

The DNA obtained from the swabs from the tape on flashlight on the bike stem (item 7C) is a mixture from at least two individuals. A major DNA contributor profile was determined. Thomas Barrera is the major DNA contributor to this sample. This conclusion is based on the assumption that Thomas Barrera does not have an identical twin. The approximate frequency of randomly selected, unrelated individuals that would be included as a possible major DNA contributor to item 7C is 1 in 15 trillion African Americans, 1 in 1.3 trillion Caucasians and 1 in 630 billion Hispanics. ^{1,3} No conclusion regarding the source of the minor alleles detected will be offered due to the limited amount of data available. Luis Simental is excluded as a possible contributor to this DNA mixture.

A partial DNA profile was obtained from the swabs from steering wheel (item 9B1). Assuming a single DNA contributor both Thomas Barrera and Luis Simental are excluded as possible sources of this DNA.

A partial DNA profile was obtained from the swabs from gearshift lever/knob (item 9F1). Assuming a single DNA contributor Luis Simental is included as a possible source of this DNA. The approximate frequency of randomly selected, unrelated individuals that would be included as possible DNA contributors to item 9F1 is 1 in 19 thousand African Americans, 1 in 50 thousand Caucasians and 1 in 29 thousand Hispanics. Thomas Barrera is excluded as a possible contributor to this DNA sample.

A partial DNA profile was obtained from the swab of knife blade (item 4B). Assuming a single DNA contributor, Thomas arrera is included as a possible source of this DNA. The approximate frequency of randomly selected, unrelated individuals that would be included as possible DNA contributors to item 4B is 1 in 13 billion African Americans, 1 in 2 in 1.6 billion Hispanics. Luis Simental is excluded as a possible contributor to this DNA sample.

¹DNA profile frequencies are calculated using population data taken from the Federal Bureau of Investigation's 1999 publication entitled "Population Data on the Thirteen CODIS Core Short Tandem Repeat Loci in African Americans, U.S. Caucasians, Hispanics, Bahamians, Jamaicans and Trinidadians". A theta value of .01 was used in accordance with recommendation 4.1 from the 1996 National Research Council Report.

² Population frequencies were calculated for randomly selected, unrelated individuals using the D3S1358, vWA, FGA, D8S1179, D21S11, D18S51, D5S818, D13S317, D7S820, D16S539, THO1, TPOX and CSF1PO loci.

³ Population frequencies were calculated for randomly selected, unrelated individuals using the D3S1358, vWA, FGA, D8S1179, D21S11, D18S51, D5S818, D13S317 and D7S820 loci.

⁴ Population frequencies were calculated for randomly selected, unrelated individuals using the D3S1358, vWA, D8S1179 and D5S818 loci.

⁵ Population frequencies were calculated for randomly selected, unrelated individuals using the D3S1358, vWA, FGA, D8S1179, D21S11, D18S51, D5S818 and D13S317 loci.

DISPOSITION OF EVIDENCE

Item 4 was returned to the Ventura County Sheriff's Department Property Room. Items 4A and 4B were consumed during analysis. All extracted and amplified DNA was discarded.

an 6 was returned to the Ventura County Sheriff's Department Property Room. Items 6A and 6B were consumed during alysis. All extracted and amplified DNA was discarded.

tems 7A, 7A1, 7A2, 7B and 7C were returned to their parent item 7. Item 7 was returned to the Ventura County Sheriff's Department Property Room. The extracted DNA from item 7A1 was consumed during analysis and the amplified DNA

Page 3 of 4

REVIEWED BY: TR

AR CL

Agot last Coiles

Case 2:08-cv-02987-RGK-SH, Document 62 Report Number 1 Filed 06/26/09 Page 19 of 46

vas discarded. Item 7B was consumed during analysis and the extracted DNA was submitted to the Ventura County Sheriff's Department Property Room as item 7B1. Item 7C and the extracted DNA from item 7C were consumed during analysis. The amplified DNA will be stored in the Forensic Biology Amp Room Freezer.

Items 8 and 12 were returned to the Ventura County Sheriff's Department Property Room. All extracted and amplified

Items 9A, 9A2, 9B, 9B2, 9C, 9D, 9D2, 9E, 9E2, 9F, 9F2, 9G, 9H, 9I and 9J were returned to their parent item 9. Item 9 was returned to the Ventura County Sheriff's Department Property Room. Item 9A1 was consumed during analysis and the extracted DNA from item 9A1 was submitted to the Ventura County Sheriff's Department Property Room as item 9A1A. Item 9B1 and the extracted DNA from item 9B1 were consumed during analysis. The amplified DNA will be stored in the Forensic Biology Amp Room Freezer. Item 9D1 and the extracted DNA from item 9D1 were consumed during analysis. The amplified DNA will be stored in the Forensic Biology Amp Room Freezer. Item 9E1 was consumed during analysis. The extracted DNA was submitted to the Ventura County Sheriff's Department Property Room as item 9E1A. Item 9F1 and the extracted DNA from item 9F1 were consumed during analysis. The amplified DNA will be stored in the

Item 10 was returned to the Ventura County Sheriff's Department Property Room.

Item 11 was returned to the Ventura County Sheriff's Department Property Room. Item 11A was consumed during analysis and the extracted DNA was submitted to the Ventura County Sheriff's Department Property Room as item 11A1.

The empty packaging for item 13 was returned to the Ventura County Sheriff's Department Property Room. Item 13 was consumed during analysis and the extracted DNA was submitted to the Ventura County Sheriff's Department Property

cems 14 and 14B were returned to the Ventura County Sheriff's Department Property Room. Item 14A was consumed uring analysis. The extracted DNA was submitted to the Ventura County Sheriff's Department Property Room as item

The empty packaging for item 15 was returned to the Ventura County Sheriff's Department Property Room. Item 15 was consumed during analysis and the extracted DNA was submitted to the Ventura County Sheriff's Department Property

guyen orensic Scientist

RINTED: 11/28/2007 3:39 PM

Page 4 of 4

EVIEWED BY:

Exhibit

ase 2:08-cv-02987-RGK-SH- Bogument 62 Filed 06/26/09 Page 21 of 46

SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT

800 S. VICTORIA AVENUE VENTURA, CA 93009 (805) 654-2370 FORENSIC SCIENCES LABORATORY REPORT

LAB CASE NUMBER L07-6430 REPORT NUMBER 3

JW

SUBJECT(S):
VICTIM: SALINAS, ANDREW
SUSPECT: BARRERA, THOMAS

AGENCY:
OXNARD POLICE DEPARTMENT: Detective Chase

AGENCY CASE NUMBER:
07-25163

OFFENSE(S):
245 P.C.

FORENSIC BIOLOGY SECTION

EVIDENCE

Item 5 (07-002516300008): Pittsburgh Multi Allen Wrench Tool Item 5A: Swab of multi-tool

OBJECTIVE / METHODS

To determine the STR DNA types from the swab of the multi-tool (item 5A) and compare these to the previously determined DNA types obtained from the reference sample taken from Thomas Barrera (item 8 see Report Number 1).

This process entails extracting DNA from the samples. The extracted DNA was amplified using the polymerase chain reaction (PCR) and a DNA profile was obtained using the AmpF/STR COfiler™ and Profiler Plus™ Amplification Kits and the ABI Prism 310 Genetic Analyzer at the following Short Tandem Repeat (STR) loci: D3S1358, vWA, FGA, D8S1179, D21S11, D18S51, D5S818, D13S317, D7S820, D16S539, THO1, TPOX, CSF1PO and the gender marker amelogenin.

RESULTS

The results from the reagent blanks and positive and negative amplification controls were as expected

CONCLUSIONS

The DNA obtained from the swab of the multi-tool (item 5A) is a mixture from at least four individuals. Thomas Barrera is included as a possible contributor to this mixture. The approximate frequency of randomly selected, unrelated individuals that would be included as possible DNA contributors to this mixture is 1 in 9.0 African Americans, 1 in 6.9 Caucasians and 1 in 7.7 Hispanics.

¹DNA profile frequencies are calculated using population data taken from the Federal Bureau of Investigation's 1999 publication entitled "Population Data on the Thirteen CODIS Core Short Tandem Repeat Loci in African Americans, U.S. Caucasians, Hispanics, Bahamians, Jamaicans and Trinidadians". A theta value of .01 was used in accordance with recommendation 4.1 from the 1996 National Research Council Report.

Population frequencies were calculated for randomly selected, unrelated individuals using the D3S1358, vWA, D8S1179, D21S11, D5S818, D13S317, THO1 and TPOX loci.

PRINTED: 2/19/2008 1:38 PM

Page 1 of 2

REVIEWED BY: 7	TR	AR Sw
----------------	----	-------

DISPOSITION OF EVIDENCE

Item 5 was returned to Forensic Scientist Kristin Rogahn. Item 5A was consumed during analysis. The remaining extracted DNA was submitted to the Ventura County Sheriff's Department Property Room as item 5A1. All amplified DNA was discarded.

Jill/Nguyen () () Forensic Scientist

RINTED: 2/12/2008 9:43 AM

Page 2 of 2

EVIEWED BY: TR AR SA

Exhibit

Case 2:08-cv-02987-RGK (36) [PACTING 106] Villad 96/26/09 Page 24 of 46

SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT

800 S. VICTORIA AVENUE VENTURA, CA 93009 (805) 654-2370 FORENSIC SCIENCES LABORATORY REPORT

LAB CASE NUMBER L07-6430

REPORT NUMBER 2 SUBJECT(S):

VICTIM:

SALINAS, ANDREW

SUSPECT:

BARRERA, THOMAS

AGENCY:

OXNARD POLICE DEPARTMENT - Det. Joe Chase

D.A.'s OFFICE - D.D.A. Richard Simon

AGENCY CASE NUMBER:

OFFENSE(S):

07-25163

245 P.C.

TRACE SECTION

EVIDENCE:

The following items were received from property:

item #004 (Agency #3) - FIXED BLADE KNIFE WITH BROKEN TIP

item #005 (Agency #8) - PITTSBURGH MULTI ALLEN WRENCH TOOL

ilab item #010 (Agency #54) - PIECE OF METAL

ab item #011 (Agency #56) - PIECE OF METAL

ab item #016 (Agency #18) - UNIFORM SHIRT

ab item #017 (Agency #19) - UNIFORM PANTS

ಪು item #018 (Agency #29) - "ANCHOR BLUE" JEANS WORN BY SUSPECT

ab item #019 (Agency #34) - BLUE "BIC" LIGHTER, MULTI TOOL ALLEN WRENCH

item #020 (Agency #36) - BLOOD STAINED BLACK T-SHIRT (not examined)

ab item #021 (Agency #37) - WHITE "SOUTH POLE" BLOOD STAINED T-SHIRT (not examined)

b item #022 (Agency #38) - WHITE "NAUTICA" BLOOD STAINED TANK TOP (not examined)

b item #023 (Agency #39) - BROWN PAPER BAG FROM SUSPECT'S RIGHT HAND (not examined)

item #024 (Agency #40) - BROWN PAPER BAG FROM SUSPECT'S LEFT HAND (not examined)

of digital photographs received from OXPD Det. Chase

VTED: 3/5/2008 2:12 PM

Page 1 of 3

IEWED BY: TR ALL 3-508AR 5-508 E

JBJECTIVE:

- 1) To examine the allen wrench tool (item #5) for the presence of blue wool fibers.
- 2) To determine if blue wool fibers from the uniform (#16 and #17) were deposited on the allen wrench tool (#5) due to contact between the tool and the uniform.
- 3) Examine the other fibers or trace evidence recovered from the allen wrench tools (#5 and #19), the suspect's pockets (#18), and the uniform's pockets (#17) in order to locate other evidence regarding the original environment of the allen wrench tool (item #5).
- 4) To determine if the metal pieces (#10 and #11) could have originally been part of the knife (#4).

RESULTS:

- 1) Examination of the tool (item #5) located many fibers, most of which were dark in color. Over 60 blue fibers were recovered. Five of these 60 fibers were a dark, purple-blue wool fiber.
- 2) Some of the purple-blue wool fibers recovered from the tool (#5), from the pockets of the uniform pants (#17), and from the pockets of the suspect's jeans (#18) were similar in color and microscopic appearance. In dition, the fibers from these three sources exhibited similar levels of weathering and fraying, characteristic of ers seen in pocket lint. However, not all of the fibers recovered from the tool (#5) showed excessive fraying. To extensive fraying was seen in standard fibers from the uniform (#16 and #17).
- 3) A red and black polymeric material was located in the pockets of the suspect's jeans (#18), as well as in the trace evidence recovered from both of the allen wrench tools (#5 and #19). The red material from these three tems was similar in terms of color, texture, physical characteristics, and chemical composition (the black material was not tested). No red and black polymeric material was seen in the pockets of the uniform pants (#17).
- In addition, the general appearance of other debris from the allen wrench tools was similar to the debris from the suspect's pockets, and unlike the debris from the pockets of the uniform.
- 4) The metal pieces (#10 and #11) showed similarity in terms of size, edge contour, physical appearance and continuity of random striations with the knife blade (#4).

INTERPRETATIONS:

- 1) Blue wool fibers were located on the allen wrench (item #5). The uniform (#16 and #17) was also made of plue wool.
- 2) No conclusion could be reached regarding whether the blue wool fibers from the allen wrench (#5) were deposited as a result of direct contact with the uniform. The blue wool fibers on the allen wrench could share a nmon source with the fibers from the uniform (#16 and #17), with the fibers from the pockets of the uniform '7), with the fibers from the suspect's pockets (#18), or with any other source of similar blue wool fibers.

RINTED: 3/5/2008 2:12 PM

Page 2 of 3

EVIEWED BY: TR # 3-5-08 K

Case 2:08-cv-02987-RGK-SH Document 62 Filed 06/26/09 Page 26 of 46

- 3) Based on the trace evidence located in the suspect's pockets, there is very strong support that the allen wrench (item #5) came from the suspect's pocket, and not the pocket of the uniform (#17).
- 4) Items #10, #11, and #4 were all one knife.

COMMENTS:

Analyses and comparisons were conducted using visual, microscopic, spectroscopic, and infrared techniques.

(RISTIN ROGAHN)

FORENSIC SCIENTIST

NTED: 3/5/2008 2:12 PM

TEWED BY: TR HL 3-5-08 AR 3-5-08 V

Exhibit

Case 2:08-cv-0298 REGIVEST FORM PART 62 Y STILE 06/26/09 Page 28 of 46 ed/Suspect DOB Victim/Reporting Person Offense CAKKELA, THOMA LVD#EVJ ovestigating Agency Date of Offense 10-0 Investigating/Requesting Officer(s) New Case Additional Exhibits CHASE / MANCELLA Related Cases: Telephone # 322-7663 太阳AED T gency File Number Person Lab Report Should Be Sent To Is Subject In Custody? 7. c 112 BALFECT - LANKSING Yes; Date of Arrest **DURT INFORMATION** BLOOD ALCOHOL ONLY Time of Arrest urt Number Court Date: Date and time of blood draw_____ Blood draw location (hospital) Sterilizing agent used_____ CDL exam needed for juvenile court? Yes Witnessing officer__ _ __ Breath results #1 Person drawing blood tails of Investigation (relevant portions of crime report may be attached) results #2 (for 11550 or 23152 cases-list suspected drugs only) THERE I E WAS CESTRULD BY SET ANDREW SACTUAL BELAKEINT INTO A VEHICL PORRERA TILD FORM IT A MELLER TORES OF had a Thick Wind Unknown IT in a ROLE SPECIFIC EXAMINATIONS REQUESTED √I Content Firearms/Toolmarks Comparison Controlled Substances Body Fluid Identification ological Analysis Operating Condition of Firearm (DNA Testing) DA Approval (Signature Required) Print/Tire Track NIBIN CODIS Controlled Substances ☐ Case filed Evidence Examination Other \square Case not filed pending lab __ ngerprint processing requested? Yesc No. 3 If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request photographs been submitted? ☐ Statute of limitations runs on If yes and for vso, fill out Photo Lab request Yes (No.) ☐ Prop 36 case yes DESCRIPTION AND SPECIFIC EXAM REQUESTED 1.5A AGENCY Exhibits (List items individually, use an Additional Exhibits form if required) item# ∌≀nal FIXED FIVE K-IFE WRIGHEN TIP MATCH ITEMS Presumptive Field Test (Drugs Only) #54 AND #56 TO KNITE FITTS RUREIL MULTI MIEN WELLET TONE + BIRES, FROM UNITERM W/RINGD. OFTHEN DHA MARKET COMPANY TO JUTE MI # 46 FROM PMY BETHE SUME I ROM (EXIT) IT CHART TO ITEMAYL. DNA SAMPLE TO BE USED FOR COMPARTSON FTA CARD ture of officer booking the evidence FOR INTERNAL USE ONLY for vso main property poor locker or across the counter) LABORATORY NUMBER CASE ASSIGNED TO Date 10/12/07 Time () DATE

yellow-laboratory plnk-submitting agency

SO 408 (6/06)

Distribution: white-sheriffs property

Case REQUEST FOR ANALYSIS (CONTINUATION FORM)

Agency Agency Number

OXNARD 07-27163

LA iten	n# Iten#	DESCRIPTION AND SPECIFIC EXAM REQUESTED Exhibits (List items individually, use an Additional Exhibits form if required)	
inter	1 1 /	CT UNITSAMPLES / CONTROL 4 BLOWN SLIDE	Presumptive Field Test
		FROM TRUCK COMPART TO ITEM # 46.	(Drugs Only)
	54	FICCE OF METAL (FOURTHE TIME FAMILE)	
		COMPANIETO ITEM#3.	
	<u>ا</u> جا	1 METAL PART (POSS, KNIFE BLADE).	
	Æ	COMPARE / MATCH TO ITEM # ?	
	160		
		DNA BUCCAL IWARS FROM SIMINTAL, LUIS (RO OF TRUCK), ELIMINATION DNA.	
	1.5.7		
		1 DNA SWAB FROM ITEM #SG.	
·	53		
	70	DNA/BLANK SWAR FLUM RCD	
		MICTAL CHIEFEL. COMPARE TO ITEM	
	59	Dalac	
		DMA SWAT, CONFECTED IT OM MISC. METAL. COMPARE TO ITEM #46	
·		10 21 (1) 41 (16)	-
		·	
			·
3 1			

SO 409 Distribution: white-sheriffs property yellow-laboratory pink-submitting agency

Case 2:08-cv-029 RECUEST FOR ANALYSIS Page 30 of 46

ACENOT In Collaboration of the	d/Suspect (Last,	First) DOB	Victim/Rep	orting Person	(Last, First)	Offense / /	the CIHI
Annual Control of the Control of the Control of Superior of the Control of Superior of S	0.02-3	a dolon			•	1/17 6 7	71085/1086
Annual Control of the Control of the Control of Superior of the Control of Superior of S	SAICICITICA /H (UMIAS 5/8/85	SALIA	IAS, ANI	KEN (5151)	Date of Offense	10/3/67
Telephone # 365 LLA # Sebent	estigating Agency	, ,				New Case	Additional Exhibits
Person Lab Report Should he Sent To DET JOE CHAST 24/93 24/	DANARD PD)	<i> ルー </i> Telephone :	iür (7/4) 4 <i>20</i> 6)	L 2470 13	Related Cases:	The state of the s
DET INFORMATION Date of Arrest CNO Property Court Date Date of Arrest CNO CNOT COURT COU						ls Subject In Co.	olo du?
Storic Action Controlled A Number Court Date: A A A A Storic Action of Court Date: A Storic Action of Court Date: A A Court Date: A Storic Action of Court Date: A Storic Action of Court Date: Broad draw (color) CDL Broad results #2	17-25/63		t .				,
Date and time of blood draw	URTINFORMATION		BL	OOD ALCOHO	L ONLY	Time of Arrest	est No
xam needed for juvenile coun? Yes No Witnessing office Breath results #1 time esuits #2 time alls of investigation (relevant portions of crime report may be attached) USPECT IS ATTEMPTIAL 75 STEAU UFHICE AND 03 FOUR USBORD OF THE SUPPLIES OF THE SUPPLI	, <i>Ī</i>		Date and tin	ne of blood dra		Blood draw locat	
The properties of crime report may be attached) The properties of crime properties of crime report may be attached) The properties of crime properties of crime report may be attached) The properties of crime properties of		. 10 ./	Sterilizing a	gent used		_CDL	
The properties of crime report may be attached) The properties of crime properties of crime report may be attached) The properties of crime properties of crime report may be attached) The properties of crime properties of	xam needed for Juvenile	courty yes No	Witnessing	officer		_Breath results	#1 time
CLE SPECIFIC EXAMINATIONS REQUESTED I Content Firearms/Toolmarks Comparison Body Fluid Identification Ological Analysis Operating Condition of Firearm DNA Testing Print/Tire Track NIBIN CODIS Controlled Substances Evidence Examination Dither Jerpint processing requested? Yes CRD If yes and for vso, fill out Bit service request Distributions runs on Prop 36 case yes no DESCRIPTION AND SPECIFIC EXAM REQUESTED Exhibits (List Items individually, use an Additional Exhibits form if required) ASSET SALWAS AND FLYING CRSS UNITED SHATT MARTINGAL BY SET SALWAS AND FRAM FIBERS ITEMS 18 + 19 TO THE BEAST SALWAS EXAMPLES AND FIBERS ITEMS 18 + 19 TO THE BEAST SALWAS FIRE SALWAS ASSEMBLY SALWAS AND FRAM FIBERS ITEMS 18 + 19 TO THE BEAST SALWAS FIRE SALWAS AND FRAM FIBERS ITEMS 18 + 19 TO THE BEAST SALWAS FIRE SALWAS AND FRAM FIBERS ITEMS 18 + 19 TO THE BEAST SALWAS FIRE SALWAS AND FRAM FIBERS ITEMS 18 + 19 TO THE BEAST SALWAS FIRE SALWAS AND FIBERS ITEMS 18 + 19 TO THE BEAST SALWAS FIRE SALWAS AND FIBERS ITEMS 18 + 19 TO THE BEAST SALWAS FIRE SALWAS SALWAS AND FIBERS ITEMS 18 + 19 TO THE BEAST SALWAS FIRE SALWAS SALWAS SALWAS AND FIBERS SALWAS SAL	ails of Investigation (rate						
CLE SPECIFIC EXAMINATIONS REQUESTED I Content Firearms/Toolmarks Comparison Ological Analysis Operating Condition of Firearm DNA Testing Print/Tire Track NIBIN CODIS Controlled Substances DA Approval (Signature Required) Case filed Case filed Case filed Case filed Case filed Case of filed pending lab I yes and for vso, fill out BI service request Firearms/Toolmarks Comparison Evidence Examination Ditor I yes and for vso, fill out BI service request Firearms/Toolmarks DESCRIPTION AND SPECIFIC EXAM REQUESTED Exhibits (List items individually, use an Additional Exhibits form if required) ASSENCY I SULVANS ASSENCY I SULVANS ASSENCY DESCRIPTION AND SPECIFIC EXAM REQUESTED Exhibits (List items individually, use an Additional Exhibits form if required) Presumption Field Once FLYING CRES* (UNIT of the Plant Field) BY SET SALWAS AND FARM OF EXAM FIREIS ITEMS 18 + 19 TO FIREIN FOUND ON ITEM 8 THAT WAS FIREIN FOUND ON	USPECT 15A	TTEMPTING 70	517: AC	πached) (UĹ///((for 11550 or 2315 こ AA9 しん	2 cases-list suspec ルカルアル おり	ted drugs only)
Controlled Substances Controlled Substances	ISPECT FLEE	ES TROM AME	A AND	I CHASE	0 BY OFFI	CFIL SUSPE	(T SWING)
Controlled Substances Controlled Substances	AIFC AT OFFI	I FIL AND OFFE	CFR FUE	EJ WEA.	20/ AT505	PECT KICU	ING SUSPICT
Controlled Substances Controlled Substances	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,				.,	, , , , , , ,	
Controlled Substances Controlled Substances							
Controlled Substances Controlled Substances Ological Analysis Operating Condition of Firearm DNA Testing DA Approval (Signature Required) Print/Tire Track NIBIN CODIS Controlled Substances Case filed Case filed Case filed Case filed Case filed Case not filed pending lab If yes and for vso, fill out BI service requests Statute of limitations runs on Prop 36 case yes no Prop 36 case yes no Presumptive Field Test Oung Only Oung Only							
Controlled Substances Controlled Substances Ological Analysis Operating Condition of Firearm DNA Testing DA Approval (Signature Required) Print/Tire Track NIBIN CODIS Controlled Substances Case filed Case filed Case filed Case filed Case filed Case not filed pending lab If yes and for vso, fill out BI service requests Statute of limitations runs on Prop 36 case yes no Prop 36 case yes no Presumptive Field Test Oung Only Oung Only			777			•	
Diagical Analysis Operating Condition of Firearm DNA Testing Print/Tire Track NIBIN CODIS Controlled Substances Evidence Examination Other Print/Tire Track NIBIN CODIS Controlled Substances Evidence Examination Other Proposition of Firearm DNA Testing Case filled Case not filled pending lab Statute of limitations runs on Prop 36 case yes no DESCRIPTION AND SPECIFIC EXAM REQUESTED Exhibits (List items individually, use an Additional Exhibits form if required) Presumptive Field Test (Drugs Conly) Presumptive Field	CLE SPECIFIC EXAMIN	ATIONS REQUESTED					
Ological Analysis Operating Condition of Firearm DNA Testing Print/Tire Track NIBIN CODIS Controlled Substances Evidence Examination Other Perprint processing requested? Yes (NO) If yes and for vso, fill out Bi service request If yes and for vso, fill out Bi service request If yes and for vso, fill out Photo Lab request If yes and for vso, fill out	1 Content	Firearms/Toolmarks Con	nparison	Body Efuid Id	lentification	Control	led Substances
Evidence Examination Differ Evidence Examination Differ Perprint processing requested? Yes (ND) If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes no If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes no If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes no If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes no If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes not BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request If yes and for vso, fill out Photo Lab request If yes and for vso, fill out Photo Lab request If yes and for vso, fill out Photo Lab request If yes and for vso, fill out Photo Lab request If yes and for vso, fill out Photo Lab request If yes and for vso, fill out Photo Lab request If yes and for vso, fill out Photo Lab request If yes and fo							
Evidence Examination Dither Case not filed pending lab Case not filed pending lab Statute of ilimitations runs on Prop 36 case yes no Prop 36 case yes no		Operating Condition of F	ırearm	DNA Testing		DA Approval (Signature Required)
Evidence Examination Other Perprint processing requested? Yes (No. If yes and for vso, fill out BI service request Statute of limitations runs on Prop 36 case yes no.	- Print/Tire Track	NIBIN CODIS		Controlled Se	ubstances	☐ Case filed	
Presumptive Field Test photographs been submitted? Yes No If yes and for vso, fill out Photo Lab request photographs been submitted? Yes No If yes and for vso, fill out Photo Lab request If yes and for vso, fill out Photo Lab request If yes and for vso, fill out Photo Lab request If yes and for vso, fill out Photo Lab request Prop 36 case yes no	Evidence Examination))(her					
DESCRIPTION AND SPECIFIC EXAM REQUESTED Exhibits (List items individually, use an Additional Exhibits form if required) Presumptive Field Test (Drugs Only)				-		☐ Case not filed [pending lab
DESCRIPTION AND SPECIFIC EXAM REQUESTED Exhibits (List items individually, use an Additional Exhibits form if required) Presumptive Field Test (Drugs Only)	⊕jerprint processing requa ⊂photographs been subm		f yes and for	vso, fill out Bi	service request	☐ Statute of limits	ations runs on
DESCRIPTION AND SPECIFIC EXAM REQUESTED Exhibits (List items individually, use an Additional Exhibits form if required) Presumptive Field Test (Orugs Only) P	J		yes and to	יאט, וווי טענ פון(no cab request		— (i
Exhibits (List items individually, use an Additional Exhibits form if required) Presumptive Field Test (Drugs Only) Presumptive Field Test (Drugs Only) Presumptive Field Test (Drugs Only) SLIT. SALIMAS ANG. PAIR OF "ECBECS" UNITER PAIT MORN BY SGT. SALWAS EXAM FEXAM FIBERS ITEMS /8 + 19 TO FIBER FOUND UNITER STHAT WAS PREVIOUSLY SUBMITTED LABORATORY NUMBER CASE ASSIGNED TO DATE CASE ASSIGNED TO DATE	L≐B AGENCY	DESCRIPTIO	N AND SOE	CIEIC EVAN F	EOUEO f en	·	
Presumptive Field Test 18		Exhibits (List items individ	lually, use an	Additional Ext	.EQUESTED uibits form if require	24)	
19 ONE FLYING CRUS" UNITO, IM SHIRT WOULD BY SOT. SALWAS 19 ONE PAIR OF "ECBECS" UNITO IM PANTI MOIN BY SOT. SALWAS EXAM- EXAM FIBERS ITEMS 18+19 TO FIBER FOUND ON ITEM 8 THAT WAS PREVIOUSLY SUBMITTED LABORATORY NUMBER CASE ASSIGNED TO DATE OATE	-····ai					ou,	Presimplive Field Test
SGT. SALWAS 19 ANG PAIR OF "ELBECO" UNITORM PANTINGRAM BY SGT. SALWAS EXAM- EXAM FIBERS ITEMS 18+19 TO FIBER FOUND UNITEM 8 THAT WAS PREVIOUSLY SUBMITTED LABORATORY NUMBER CASE ASSIGNED TO: Date Date		- weight the	200011				
ANT PAIR OF "E(BECS" UNITERNAL USE ONLY EXAM - EXAM FIBERS ITEMS /8+19 TO FIBER FOUND UNITEM 8 THAT WAS PREVIOUSLY SUBMITTED LABORATORY NUMBER CASE ASSIGNED TO DATE	10 1	ONE PLYING CH	COSS (1/	1110, cm	SHUTT Worls	104	
EXAM - EXAM FIBERS ITEMS 18 + 19 TO FIBER FOUND UNITEM 8 THAT WAS REVIOUSLY SUBMITTED LABORATORY NUMBER CASE ASSIGNED TO DATE		SGT. SALIMAS					·
EXAM - EXAM FIBERS ITEMS 18 + 19 TO FIBER FOUND UNITEM 8 THAT WAS REVIOUSLY SUBMITTED LABORATORY NUMBER CASE ASSIGNED TO DATE	19	ONE PAIR OF	E(BEC	S'UNILEA	Rm PANTI	Madal	
EXAM - EXAM FIBERS ITEMS 18419 TO FIBER) FOUND UNITEM 8 THAT WAS REVIOUSLY SUBMITTED LABORATORY NUMBER CASE ASSIGNED TO DATE CASE ASSIGNED TO DATE		BY SET SALLA	Δζ			K 401114	
TIBER FOUND ON THE STHAT WAS REVIOUSLY SUBMITTED FOR INTERNAL USE ONLY LABORATORY NUMBER CASE ASSIGNED TO DATE		21.44	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , 				
TIBER FOUND ON THE STHAT WAS REVIOUSLY SUBMITTED FOR INTERNAL USE ONLY LABORATORY NUMBER CASE ASSIGNED TO DATE		<u></u>				• • •	
ISEVIOUSLY SUISMITTED cure of officer booking the evidence FOR INTERNAL USE ONLY for vso main groberty ream locker or across the counter) LABORATORY NUMBER CASE ASSIGNED TO DATE							
ISEVIOUSLY SUISMITTED cure of officer booking the evidence FOR INTERNAL USE ONLY for vso main groberty ream locker or across the counter) LABORATORY NUMBER CASE ASSIGNED TO DATE		LIDER FOUNT	<u>000</u>	ITFM 8	THAT WA	2	
LABORATORY NUMBER CASE ASSIGNED TO Date Date Cure of officer booking the evidence FOR INTERNAL USE ONLY LABORATORY NUMBER CASE ASSIGNED TO DATE							
tor vso main property regim locker or across the counter) LABORATORY NUMBER CASE ASSIGNED TO: Date 100 Jame 1505 DATE							
LABORATORY NUMBER Ure: Date 10/10/10/10/10/10/10/10/10/10/10/10/10/1					FOR INTER	(NAL HSE OWEVE	
CASE ASSIGNED TO: Date 1505 DATE			ounter)		r. Sers. U.S. 1.44	MORANE CHEF	
Date 19/1/19 Ime 15/15 DATE	15.21	<i>9/</i> /					
	11222 66 11 112 112 112 112 112 112 112		* 		DTO		
SO 408 (6/06) Distribution: white-sheriff's property yellow-laboratory pink-submitting agency	THY	ише <u>/ ></u> д> <u>-</u>)AFE			
	SO 408 (6/06)	Distribution: white-sheriffs	s property ve	flow-laboratory	pink-submitting age	lev	

Case 2:08-cv-02987-RGK-SH, Document 62 Filed 06/26/09 Page 31 of 46 REQUEST FOR ANALYSIS

A. d/Suspect (Last, First) DOB	Victim/Reporting Person (Last, First)	Offense
5077 570 THE OF 5/1	4	·
DARREA THOMAS 5/01 Investigating Agency	85 SALINAS ANDREW (SGT)	
,	Investigating/Requesting Officer(s)	New Case Additional Exhibits
DXMARD P.D	Telephone # 3857(563	Related Cases:
gency File Number	Person Lab Report Should Be Sent To	Is Subject In Custody?
07-75163	DET JOE CHASE 2493	Van Dit 11
OURT INFORMATION	BLOOD ALCOHOL ONLY	Yes; Date of ArrestNo
ourt Number. Court Date:	Date and time of blood draw	Blood draw location (hospital)
N/A		
exam needed for juvenile court? Yes No	Witnessing officer	Breath results #1 fime
SUSPECT PLEES Film A	TO STEAL AUTHILLE AND UB TO STEAL AUTHILLE AND UB TEA AND IS CHASEN BY OF	D2 Cases-list suspected drugs only) いこれだの BY かったいない にいてオートのヤル・こういれの
IRCLE SPECIFIC EXAMINATIONS REQUEST	ED.	
		Controlled 601
f Content Firearms/Toolmark	s Comparison Body Fluid Identification	Controlled Substances
cological Analysis Operating Condition	of Firearm DNA Testing	DA Approved (6)
0115	3	DA Approval (Signature Required)
e Print/Tire Track NIBIN COI	OIS Controlled Substances	☐ Case filed
e Evidence Examination Other		
ingerprint processing requested? Yes (No.		Case not filed pending lab
engerprint processing requested? Yes No ⇒ photographs been submitted? Yes No		☐ Statute of limitations runs on
	, land the second of the secon	☐ Prop 36 case yes no
LAB AGENCY DESCR	IDTION AND SOCIETY FYAM DEGUES	
"" " Exhibits (List items in	IPTION AND SPECIFIC EXAM REQUESTED notividually, use an Additional Exhibits form if require	الدمة
inginal	21 co and regularizations for the first	Presumptive Field Tést
29 / Parz "A		1
47. //A/Z A	NOW BLUF " JEANS WORF	184
SUSPECT	<u> </u>	
	<u> </u>	
E V 2 2 - 2		
EXAMPLOS	71311111	
Compart	FIBERS FROM PREVIOURY	
SUBMITTED.	TIEM TO FIBERI FOUND 1	N POCKETS
JUTAIN GINA	PANTS BELLINGHIL TOSUSPEC	
(17)	0)	
(1111)	0/	
tora of afficient health discovery		
ature of officer booking the evidence Y for vso main property room locker or across	FOR INTE	RNAL USE ONLY
William Annual A	LABORATORY NUMBER	
ture // 1/1/1/1/9	CASE ASSIGNED TO	
Bate 12-111 7 Time 12 113	DATE	
SO 408 (6/06) Distribution: white-si	heriff's property yellow-laboratory pink-submitting age	ncy 00552

Case 2:08-cv-02987-RGK-SH Document 62 Filed 06/26/09 Page 32 of 46 REQUEST FOR ANALYSIS

d/Suspect (L	ast, First) DOB	Victim/Re	porting Person	(Last, First)	Offense	
ARRENA,	e dolar	-	1	/		
estigating Agency	7 - 2/8/82 -	DAC!	NAS AN	1)17EW(S6T	<u></u>	
oungoing Agency	,		ing/Requesting		New Case	Additional Exhibits
JXNATO)	2. D	Telephone	JUE CHAS	51: 7493	Related Cases:	Approximate which represents the same of t
ency File Number			<u>が、るけつ</u> b Report Should	7 6 63 1 Bo Sout To	In California	
11-25/6	₹	_			Is Subject In Cu	
URTINFORMATION		1 / 1 B	JOE SHAS LOOD ALCOH	1- 14 43	Yes; Date of Ar	
urt Number	Court Date:			W	Time of Arrest	
NA		Sterilizing			Blood draw loca CDL	tion (hospital)
exam needed for juve	nile court? Yes No	Witnessing	officer		Breath results	#1 time
		rerson ara	iwina hlaad		4.	***
tails of Investigation (relevant portions of crime re	port may be	attached)	(for 11550 or 2315		
) 0 01 666 7	2 X/11/W/1/1/0 0	105/	7.216 24 U f	THECKA	MD 15 0135	EAVED 184
VEFICED 5	USPECT FLECT	FIA	m Allia	ANDJER	11.65 - 21	1 2
157		, ,-0	7 170.0	(7/1497) C	AM) = 0 07	officed,
071: C1 20	NINES KNIFE	ATOI	FFICCIR,	ANDOFF	ICER FIRE	S WFAPON
TSUSPICT.	KILLIAG SUSP	ć (T			•	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
,	1-1					
			-			
HOLE SPECIFIC EXAI	MINATIONS REQUESTED					
Contont	Fig. 7. I. O.				Contro	lled Substances
Content	Firearms/Toolmarks Co	mparison	Body Fluid I	dentification		outstances
cological Analysis	Operating Condition of F	irearm	DNA Testing	3	DA Approval ((Signature Required)
- PrinVTire Track	MIDIN CODIO			-	Orroppiovar	orginature Required)
= FIND THE TIACK	NIBIN CODIS		Controlled S	Substances	Case filed	
e Evidence Examinat	ion Other				Casa not start	19
gerprint processing re	aguantad? Van Na	14			lf .	pending lab
- photographs been s		if yes and to	or vso, till out Bl or vso, fill out Ph	service request oto Lab request	☐ Statute of limit	ations runs on
		,		· i	☐ Prop 36 case	yes no
. AB AGENOV	DECORIDA	211 411D 0F	.=			
t AB AGENCY	Exhibits (List items individual	JN AND SE	ECIFIC EXAM	REQUESTED		
ternal	Exhibits (List items individ	dually, use	an Additional Ex	nibits form if requir	red)	
use						Presumptive Field Test (Drugs Only)
34	DIVE BK	6161	iER MI	ILTI-TO	<u></u>	
	ALLENIAR	FNC			70m	
٠٠٠	1 () 1		-3'			
	100	<u> </u>	POCICET	of Susp	ECTY_	
	Tranis	<u></u>	<u>.</u> .			
136	1 BIACK B	1001)	STAIN	-3750		
				ED T-SH	11(1)	-
	(OCECTED	HROM	10.505	PECTS K	001)4	,
	AT AUTUPS	¥		, in	•	
ature of officer book(r	ng the evidence			FOR INTE	RNAL USE ONLY	
Y for vso main propert	y toom locker or across the c	ounter)				
11 11	N. Comments		LABORATORY			
ature <i>[[12]</i>			CASE ASSIGN	IĘD TO		
Date//G///&	7 Time 1074		DATE			
SO 408 (6/06)	Distribution: white-sheriff	's property	vellouslaborata	pink-submitting age		
		- 2 - 100, 13	2 - 11 - 11 (appliatol à	Firm-sonuntiffud age	шсу	00553

Case 2:03-02987-RGK-SH Document 62 Filed 06/26/09 Page 33 of 46 CONTINUATION FORM)

Agency Agency Number

07.25163

LAB Hem#	AGENCY Item#	DESCRIPTION AND SPECIFIC EXAM REQUESTED Exhibits (List items individually, use an Additional Exhibits form if required)	
internal use	37		Presumptive Field Test (Orugs Only)
:		LIMHITE BLOOD STAINED "SOUTH POLE" T-SHIRT, COLLECTED FROM SUSPECTS BODY AT AUTOPSY	
	38	I WHITE "NAUDICA" BLOODER 1505	
		TOP, CUCLCUTED FROM SUSPECTS BODY AT AUTOPSY	
	39	I BROWN PAPER BALFROM SUSPECTS RIGHT HAND, COLLECTED FROM SUSPECTS BODY AT AUTO25Y	
	40	1 BILUUN PAPER BAL FROM SUSPECTS LEFT HAND, COLLECTED FROM SUSPECT S BUDY AT AUTOPSY	
		EXAMPLE FOR FIBERS AND COMPARE - FIBERS TO PREVIOUSLY SUBMITTED	~
		ADDIDULALITEMS REQUESTED BY CRIME LAB PERSONNEL	
			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
	-		
HASE	1.9	7078 - 1200000 -	

HASE 1-9.04 7078 - MILLEY-

SO 409 Distribution: white-sheriff's property yellow-laboratory plnk-submitting agency

Exhibit

OFFICE: (805) 815-4610 E-FAX' (805) 800-1880

DANIEL C. MORGAN & ASSOCIATES ATTORNEYS AT LAW

1591 SPINNAKER DRIVE SUITE ZOS VENTURA, CALIFORNIA 93001 E-MAIL.

DANIELMORGAN LAW & A OL COM

November 12, 2007

OXNARD POLICE DEPARTMENT 251 S. "C" Street Oxnard, CA 93030

Re: Barrera, Este of Tomas Barrera et al v.City of Oxnard, Andrew Salinas

Dear Custodian of Records:

Please be advised that this office has been retained to represent Tomas Barrera, the father of Tomas Barrera Jr. who was shot and killed by Officer Andrew Salinas on October 4, 2007, at 5% and G Streets in Oxnard, California.

We hereby formally request that you preserve the following evidence in their original condition:

- 1. All audio recordings of telephone communications regarding the subject incident;
- 2. All documents pertaining to the CAD system regarding the subject incident;
- 3. All physical evidence, including bullets removed from the victim, shell casings, the gun used in the subject incident, and any other physical evidence gathered at the scene;
- 4. All car to car recordings regarding the subject incident;

All real to real recordings regarding the subject incident;

6. All photographs taken at the scene of the shooting; and

7. All recorded statements taken by any witnesses.

OKMARD POLICE DEPT

U တု

20

Please be advised that fallure to preserve the items identified above in their immediate post-accident condition may result in liability for willful destruction of evidence. Your failure to preserve this evidence, without modifying, altering, or destroying the evidence, may subject you to substantial civil monetary damages. Be advised that we intend to seek remedies against you if you allow crucial evidence in this case to be modified, altered or destroyed

Post-It' Fax Note 7671_	Date 14-07 pages
TOJIM EICHER	From Ben Chavez
Cn./Dopt.	Co.
Phono 1 27 8 0 289	Phone 3 25 776
FBX #	Fax fi

Mr. Daniel Morgan

Re: Barrera, Este of Tomas Barrera et al v.City of Oxnard, Andrew Salinas

November 12, 2007

Page 2

Please advise us immediately of the status of the evidence and your office's intentions with respect to its preservation. If your office will not agree to preserve the evidence, we are hereby offering to transport it to our secured storage facility and pay related storage costs so that the evidence is preserved.

At this time, we request an opportunity to conduct an inspection for the purpose of photographing, copying, recording, and/or videotaping all of the aforementioned items of evidence. Please contact the undersigned upon receipt of this letter to discuss disposition of the evidence.

We ask that you direct any future communications and/or correspondence to the undersigned. Please do not contact our client personally.

Thank you for your anticipated courtesy and cooperation in this matter. If you have any questions, please feel free to contact me.

Very truly yours,

Daniel Morgan,

DANIEL C. MORGAN & ASSOCIATES

Attorneys at Law

Exhibit

LAW OFFICES OF

ALAN E. WISOTSKY BRIAN P. KEIGHRON JEFFREY HELD JAMES S. EICHER, JR DIRK DOGENNA ALAN E. WISOTSKY
FINANCIAL PLAZA TOWER
300 ESPLANADE DRIVE, SUITE 1506
OXNARD, CALIFORNIA 93036

TELEPHONE (805) 278-0920
FACSIMILE (805) 278-0289
E-MAIL langer: @wisc/skylow.com
www.wisotskylow.com

November 20, 2007

Daniel C. Morgan Daniel C. Morgan & Associates 1591 Spinnaker Drive, Suite 205 Ventura, CA 93001

Re: Barrera v. City of Oxnard, et al.

Dear Mr. Morgan:

This is in response to your letter of November 12, 2007, to the custodian of records at the Oxnard Police Department regarding the above referenced matter. This office represents the City of Oxnard, and, in particular, the Oxnard Police Department and Andrew Salinas with respect to this matter.

Your request for preservation of evidence is noted. Your request to conduct an inspection for the purpose of photocopying, copying, etc., of the evidence gathered thus far in the case is denied. The incident is still under investigation by the Oxnard Police Department and the Ventura County District Attorney's Office.

We shall comply with your request to communicate only with your office and expect the same professional and ethical commitment from you as it relates to the City of Oxnard, Oxnard Police Department, and Andrew Salinas.

Very truly yours

ALAN E. WISOTSKY

AEW: jm

cc: Sgt. Ben Chavez, OXPD

FILE COPY

NN478

Rahibit

law offices of kim d. scovis

A Professional Corporation

Kim D. Scovis Jenny Scovis

Arthur L. Scovis (1942-2004)

223 E. Thousand Oaks Blvd Suite 412 Thousand Oaks CA 91360 (805) 496-6413 Fax (805) 379 -3966

January 14, 2008

Gregory B. Bragg & Associates, Inc. Attn: Peter Yee P.O. Box 3544 Ventura, CA 93006-3544

Re: Maria Lazos

Dear Mr. Yee:

Pursuant to your request for documentation with regard to the above claimant, I have enclosed two pieces of correspondence requesting the same.

In the interim should you have any further questions, please do not hesitate to call. Thank you for the courtesy of your cooperation in this matter.

Sincerely,

Lauren Hochman Legal Secretary

enc

law offices of kim

A Professional Corporat

Kim D. Scovis Jenny Scovis

Arthur L. Scovis (1942-2004)

January 7, 2008

VIA U.S. CERTIFIED MAIL RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

Gregory D. Totten
VENTURA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
800 South Victoria Avenue
Ventura, CA 93009

Re: Maria Lazos

Dear Mr. Totten:

Our offices represent Maria Lazos in her claims against certain public agencies and/or other entities and individuals in connection with the death of her son, Thomas Barrera, on October 3, 2007. On that date, Mr. Barrera was shot several times and killed by Sergeant Andrew Salinas of the Oxnard Police Department. It is our understanding that Sgt. Salinas was acting under color of law at the time of the incident and circumstances leading up to Mr. Barrera's death.

As you may or may not be aware, this firm filed a Claim Against Public Entity on behalf of Ms. Lazos, which identifies as Respondents those individuals and agencies involved in Mr. Barrera's death, including, but not limited to, the City of Oxnard, the Oxnard Police Department, Sgt. Salinas, and John Crombach, the acting Police Chief. The claim alleges violations of certain federal and state civil rights and seeks damages under California tort law for the respondents' individual and/or collective acts and/or failures to act.

One of our objectives is to obtain a determination of the facts and circumstances surrounding Mr. Barrera's death. In meeting that goal, we have retained and intend to engage forensic and other appropriate experts and consultants we believe are necessary to conduct a thorough investigation.

It is our understanding that your office has assigned certain of its deputy district attorneys in this matter. The primary purpose of this correspondence is to request that any and all writings¹ that relate to the investigation of this incident, as well as any and all pertinent events prior to and

111	- (Domestic Mail Or	MAIL THE REC	i) Mywynabaycous
קנפל פססס סנקס	Postage Certified Fee Return Receipt Fee (Endorsement Required) Restricted Delivery Fee (Endorsement Required) Total Postage & Fees	\$ 41 24 215 215 \$ 5 ²¹	Postmark Here
0 2002	Sent To (AB-70) Street, Apt. No.; or PO Box No. City, State, ZIP+4 PS Form 3800, August	Down Nor	VC D.A. WA Avi G3 604 See Reverse for Instrustions

As defined in California Evidence Code Section 250, the term "writing" means handwriting, typewriting, printing, photostating, photographing, photocopying, transmitting by electronic mail or facsimile, and every other means of recording upon any tangible thing, any form of communication or representation, including letters, words, pictures, sounds, or symbols, or combinations thereof, and any record thereby created, regardless of the manner in which the record has been stored.

Gregory D. Totten January 7, 2008 Page Two

subsequent the shooting, including all evidence, documentary or otherwise, which has been obtained and/or is within your possession, custody and/or control, be made available for review and/or inspection by our experts and consultants as soon as possible.

It is foreseeable that our experts will want to personally examine any and all evidence items. With that in mind, we would respectfully request that no destructive testing be performed on any evidence, to the extent allowable, that would destroy any evidence or otherwise render it unusable for further forensic examination. If you or your agency cannot honor this request, it is requested that we be given sufficient advance notification of any and all testing of evidence that may be destructive and/or otherwise exhaust further examination. "Sufficient advance notification" would permit the opportunity to seek judicial intervention in the event a court order or other injunction becomes necessary.

Finally, we are requesting that a copy of the autopsy report of Thomas Barrera, together with any associated documentation prepared in connection with this incident, be provided to us as soon as possible. Your assistance in expediting that report to our offices is greatly appreciated. To that end, the report may be sent via facsimile to 805/379-3966.

If you have any questions or need further information, please do not hesitate to give me a call. I look forward to a prompt communication from your office in response to the foregoing.

Thank you for the courtesy of your cooperation in this matter.

Sincerely,

KIM D. SCOVIS

KDS/lrm

cc: Maria Lazos

Certified Mail No. 7007 0710 0003 7217 3588

Postmark

Hale

law offices of kin

A Professional Corpora

Kim D. Scovis Jenny Scovis

Arthur L. Scovis (1942-2004)

January 7, 2008

Return Receipt Fee

Restricted Delivery Fee (Endersement Required)

VIA U.S. CERTIFIED MAIL RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

John Crombach, Police Chief OXNARD POLICE DEPARTMENT 251 South "C" Street Oxnard, CA 93030

Re: Maria Lazos

Dear Chief Crombach:

Our offices represent Maria Lazos in her claims against certain public agencies and/or other entities and individuals in connection with the death of her son, Thomas Barrera, on October 3, 2007. On that date, Mr. Barrera was shot several times and killed by Sergeant Andrew Salinas of the Oxnard Police Department. It is our understanding that Sgt. Salinas was acting under color of law at the time of the incident and circumstances leading up to Mr. Barrera's death.

As you may be aware, this firm filed a Claim Against Public Entity on behalf of Ms. Lazos, which identifies as Respondents those individuals and agencies involved in Mr. Barrera's death, including, but not limited to, the City of Oxnard, the Oxnard Police Department, Sgt. Salinas, and yourself as acting Police Chief. The claim alleges violations of certain federal and state civil rights and seeks damages under California tort law for the respondents' individual and/or collective acts and/or failures to act.

One of our objectives is to obtain a determination of the facts and circumstances surrounding Mr. Barrera's death. In meeting that goal, we have retained and intend to engage forensic and other appropriate experts and consultants we believe are necessary to conduct a thorough investigation.

The primary purpose of this correspondence is to request that any and all writings¹ that relate to the investigation of this incident, as well as any and all pertinent events prior to and subsequent the shooting, including all evidence, documentary or otherwise, which has been obtained and/or

As defined in *California Evidence Code Section 250*, the term "writing" means handwriting, typewriting, printing, photostating, photographing, photocopying, transmitting by electronic mail or facsimile, and every other means of recording upon any tangible thing, any form of communication or representation, including letters, words, pictures, sounds, or symbols, or combinations thereof, and any record thereby created, regardless of the manner in which the record has been stored.

John Crombach January 7, 2008 Page Two

is within your possession, custody and/or control, be made available for review and/or inspection by our experts and consultants as soon as possible.

It is foreseeable that our experts will want to personally examine any and all evidence items. Therefore, we are requesting that our experts be given immediate access to the vehicle (i.e., the pick-up truck) which we understand was involved when Sgt. Salinas allegedly first observed Mr. Barrera on the date the shooting occurred. It is also critical for our experts to have immediate access to the decedent's clothing at the time of this incident, any and all weapons allegedly discovered at the scene of the incident, any and all photographs or other depictions of the scene of the incident and/or of the decedent at any time, and/or any and all physical or other evidence purportedly related to this incident.

We would also respectfully request that no destructive testing be performed on any evidence, to the extent allowable, that would destroy any evidence or otherwise render it unusable for further forensic examination. If you or your agency cannot honor this request, it is requested that we be given sufficient advance notification of any and all testing of evidence that may be destructive and/or otherwise exhaust further examination. "Sufficient advance notification" would permit the opportunity to seek judicial intervention in the event a court order or other injunction becomes necessary.

Finally, we are requesting that a copy of the autopsy report of Thomas Barrera, together with any associated documentation prepared in connection with this incident, be provided to us as soon as possible. Your assistance in expediting that report to our offices is greatly appreciated. To that end, the report may be sent via facsimile to 805/379-3966.

If you have any questions or need further information, please do not hesitate to give me a call. I look forward to a prompt communication from your office in response to the foregoing.

Thank you for the courtesy of your cooperation in this matter.

Sincerely,

KIM D. SCOVIS

KDS/lrm

cc: Maria Lazos

Certified Mail No. 7007 0710 0003 7217 3571

1 PROOF OF SERVICE 2 I am employed in the county of Ventura, State of California. I am over the age of 3 eighteen and not a party to the within action, and my business address is: Law Offices of Kim 4 D. Scovis, 223 E. Thousand Oaks Blvd., Suite 412, Thousand Oaks, CA 91360. 5 On June 26, 2009, I served the following document(s): PLAINTIFFS MOTION IN LIMINE NO. 9 TO EXCLUDE ANY EVIDENCE 6 7 PERTAINING TO THE 6" FIXED BLADE KNIFE, PIECE OF METAL (POSS 8 KNIFE BLADE); METAL CHISEL; ALLEN WRENCH TOOL SET; THE 9 FOLDING KNIFE, THE SYRINGE FOUND IN DECEDENT'S POCKET AND 10 THE SWABS FROM THE BMX BIKE 11 on the interested parties in this action by placing a true and correct copy thereof enclosed in 12 a sealed envelope addressed as follows: 13 Law Office of Alan E. Wistosky Law Office of Gregory A. Yates, P.C. Attention: Mr. Dirk DeGenna Attn: Gregory Yates 14 300 Esplanade Drive, Suite 1500 16830 Ventura Blvd., #250 Oxnard, CA 93036 Encino, CA 91436 15 16 Daniel C. Morgan & Assoc. 1591 Spinnaker Doctor., #205 17 Ventura, CA 93001 18 I am readily familiar with the business' practice for collection and processing 19 of correspondence and mailing with the United States Postal Service; such 20 correspondence would be deposited with the United States Postal Service the 21 same day of deposit in the ordinary course of business. I know that the 22 envelope was sealed and, with postage thereon fully prepaid, placed for 23 collection and mailing on this date, following ordinary business practices, in 24 the United States mail at Thousand Oaks, California. 25 Fed Ex overnight service. 26 By Personal Service, I caused such envelope to be delivered by hand to the 27 above address(es). 28 By facsimile, I caused such document to be transmitted via facsimile

PROOF OF SERVICE

	Case 2:08-cv-02987-RGK-SH Document 62 Filed 06/26/09 Page 46 of 46			
1	machine, to the above address(es)			
2	(State) I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of			
3	California that the foregoing is true and correct.			
4	X (Federal) I declare that I am employed in the office of a member of the bar			
5	of this court at whose direction the service was made.			
6	Executed on June 26, 2009, at Thousand Oaks, California			
7				
8	-1001			
9	Roschelle Ayo nayon			
10				
11				
12				
13				
14				
15 16				
17				
18				
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				
25				
26				
27				
28				

PROOF OF SERVICE